



# Fifth Program Year CAPER

## Executive Summary

In accordance with 24 CFR Part 91, Subpart F, Section 91.520, the City of Muskegon Heights, Michigan must submit a Consolidated Annual Performance Evaluation Report, (CAPER) to the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). The information provided is in support of the City's actions taken that are in alignment with its Action Plan.

Each year the City, a federally designated Entitlement Community, receives funding under the Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) Program based upon a formula allocation. These funds are then used to meet long range goals/objectives as identified:

- To improve market conditions which may aid in stabilizing property values;
- To increase concentrations of single-family owner-occupied housing units;
- To enhance property values;
- To create a balance between rental verses owner occupied properties; and,
- To assist residents that is low-mod income homeowners in the rehabilitation of their home which may provide for neighborhood stability.

Strategies used in meeting long range goals/objectives include, but is not limited to, the following:

- Concentrate public resources in support of the housing market, including improvements to infrastructure, code enforcement, school, public safety and other municipal services;
- Target public investments based upon the potential for financial returns to local residents by stimulating additional leverage of private reinvestments;
- Continue Citywide Homeowner Paint, Priority - Moderate - Substantial Repair Programs;
- Continue rigorous Code Enforcement Programs for rental, owner occupied and commercial properties;
- Continue to identify pre-1978 housing units with children under the age of 7 and that may have lead based hazards;
- Continue to implement HUD Section 3 Regulations, as best as possible, relative to all HUD supported projects; and,
- To expose recipients, whenever possible/applicable, to home repair education.

## General Questions

1. Assessment of the one-year goals and objectives:
  - a. Describe the accomplishments in attaining the goals and objectives for the reporting period.

Jurisdiction

- b. Provide a breakdown of the CPD formula grant funds spent on grant activities for each goal and objective.
- c. If applicable, explain why progress was not made towards meeting the goals and objectives.

During the 2015/41st Year (FY 2015-2016), the City received \$399,470. The programs/projects undertaken and their accomplishments in lieu of this funding is as follows:

General Administration: CDBG funds used as leverage for program administration, project design, and financial management of grants which are in alignment with the CDBG National Objectives. (21A-570.206)

2015/41st Year Budgeted	Carry-Over/Reprogram	Total Funds	Expended	Balance
\$79,894.00	\$0	\$79,894.00	\$79,894.00	\$0

Rehabilitation Administration: CDBG funds used as leverage to support daily operations of all housing rehab and construction programs, to ensure quality control under the City’s housing and HUD Section 8 HQS Program Standards, abandoned structures, environmental and nuisance abatement properties as well as demolition. (14H-570.202)

2015/41st Year Budgeted	Carry-Over/Reprogram	Total Funds	Expended	Balance
\$65,000.00	\$0	\$65,000.00	\$65,000.00	\$0

Priority Repair: Funds used to finance minor repairs of owner occupied housing. (14h-570.202)

Projected Accomplishments	Accomplishments	Year to Date	5 Year Goal
10	10	48	50

2015/41st Year Budgeted	Carry-Over/Reprogram	Total Funds	Expended	Balance
\$59,000.00	\$23,841.41	\$82,841.14	\$82,841.14	\$0

Moderate Rehabilitation: Funds used to finance the replacement of one major repair for owner occupied housing in the area of an electrical, plumbing, and mechanical or roof repair. (14A-570.202)

Projected Accomplishments	Accomplishments	Year to Date	5 Year Goal
05	05	29	25

2015/41st Year Budgeted	Carry-Over/Reprogram	Total Funds	Expended	Balance
\$85,000.00	\$0	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$0

City Wide Paint/Siding: Funds were to provide paint, painting services and/or siding for owner occupied housing units. (14A-570.202)

Projected Accomplishments	Accomplishments	Year to Date	5 Year Goal
25	25	125	50

2015/41st Year Budgeted	Carry-Over/Reprogram	Total Funds	Expended	Balance
\$50,000.00	\$1,905.35	\$51,905.35	\$51,905.35	\$0

Jurisdiction

The City’s goal was to complete up to 25 projects under this category. Projected accomplishments for the 5 Year Goal were accomplished, during 2<sup>nd</sup> PY.

Code Enforcement: Funds used to inspect housing units, address environmental concerns/blight as well as support efforts geared towards illegal dumping(s). (15-570-202C)

2015/41st Year Budgeted	Carry-Over/Reprogram	Total Funds	Expended	Balance
\$10,076.00	\$10,303.91	\$20,379.91	\$20,379.91	\$0

**SPECIAL NOTE:** Inspections are being performed on a city-wide basis with notices sent daily. Appropriate follow-ups and violations/tickets are issued when applicable. Approximately, 130 tickets were issued, 60 enforcements, and 30 violations.

Demolition: Funds used to demolish troubled, vacant, and dangerous structures city-wide. (04-570-201D)

Projected Accomplishments	Accomplishments	Year to Date	5 Year Goal
10	10	46	50

2015/41st Year Budgeted	Carry-Over/Reprogram	Total Funds	Expended	Balance
\$15,000.00	\$0	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$0

Landlord/Tenant Rights Program: Funds used to provide legal services, information, referrals and dispute resolution to resident tenants. Sub-recipient: Western Michigan Legal Services. (05-K570-201E)

Projected Accomplishments	Accomplishments	Year to Date	5 Year Goal
N/A	30	200	50

2015/41st Year Budgeted	Carry-Over/Reprogram	Total Funds	Expended	Balance
\$5,000.00	\$0	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$0

**SPECIAL NOTE:** The Landlord/Tenant Rights Program has proven to be a solid program with consistent representation, good support, and a real need for the residents of Muskegon Heights. For the past two program year’s, accomplishments were not projected for this program due to the program exceeding its 5 Year Goal the 3<sup>rd</sup> Program Year.

Fair Housing: Provides funding for the continued efforts in promoting Fair Housing Studies.

Projected Accomplishments	Accomplishments	Year to Date	5 Year Goal
N/A	N/A	25	25

2015/41st Year Budgeted	Carry-Over/Reprogram	Total Funds	Expended	Balance
\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$0

Funding for this program was used to cover any perceived cost associated with positively furthering fair housing. Initiatives include, but are not limited to Complaint Investigation, Housing Testing, and Education/Outreach. Attached for your information are reports in support of this component.

## Jurisdiction

Mona Lake Park – Phase III: Funds used to aid in facility improvements/equipment.

2015/41st Year Budgeted	Carry-Over/Reprogram	Total Funds	Expended	Balance
\$15,000.00	\$0	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$0

Recreation: Funds used in serving as match for grant initiatives relative to park improvements/expansion.

Projected Accomplishments	Accomplishments	Year to Date	5 Year Goal
N/A	N/A	2	2

2015/41st Year Budgeted	Carry-Over/Reprogram	Total Funds	Expended	Balance
\$5,000.00	\$0	\$5,000.00	\$0	\$5,000.00

Smoke Detector: Funds used to provide smoke alarms and supplies for income eligible homeowner occupied residents.

Projected Accomplishments	Accomplishments	Year to Date	5 Year Goal
N/A	50	150	N/A

2015/41st Year Budgeted	Carry-Over/Reprogram	Total Funds	Expended	Balance
\$3,500.00	\$5.10	\$3,505.10	\$3,505.10	\$0

Neighborhood Clean-Up: Funds used to provide for city-wide blight abatement.

Projected Accomplishments	Accomplishments	Year to Date	5 Year Goal
N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

2015/41st Year Budgeted	Carry-Over/Reprogram	Total Funds	Expended	Balance
\$4,500.00	\$7,896.00	\$12,396.00	\$8,020.00	\$12,396.00

### 1. Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing:

The City continues its relationship with the Fair Housing Center of West Michigan in its attempt to minimize impediments which may impede access to fair housing. Due to the City's unique composition, the tests performed are inconclusive. However, measures taken still include performing test, investigation, education and outreach services, along with heavily enforcing codes to minimize and address blighted influences. Subsequently, the Section 3 Report has been forwarded electronically in support of this initiative.

## Managing the Process

1. Describe actions taken during the last year to ensure compliance with program and comprehensive planning requirements.

The Planning and Community Development Department works to ascertain the compliance and carryout of programs and objectives based on HUD Regulations. The City continues to

## Jurisdiction

review the overall management of CDBG Programs and its effectiveness. Through continued support and technical assistance provided via HUD, the City has been able to enhance its comprehensive program delivery.

## Citizen Participation

1. Provide a summary of citizen comments.

\*Please note that Citizen Comments and Responses may be included as additional files within the CPMP Tool.

The public comment period will be held August 16<sup>th</sup> 2016 through September 16<sup>th</sup> 2016. A public hearing will be held on September 12<sup>th</sup> 2016 at 5:30 p.m. in the city's council chambers at 5:30 PM. Written questions and/or comments will be included as part of the official record. A copy of the CAPER is made available for your review/information at the City of Muskegon Heights; Planning and Community Development Department; 2724 Peck Street; Muskegon Heights, Michigan 49444 or via website at [cityofmuskegonheights.org](http://cityofmuskegonheights.org).

## Institutional Structure

1. Describe actions taken during the last year to overcome gaps in institutional structures and enhance coordination.

The City of Muskegon Heights not only serves as the primary administrator for CDBG funding but provides a full range of services to its residents relative to case coordination and support. Social oriented needs are addressed by human service delivery agencies, such as the Department of Health and Human Services, United Way of the Lakeshore's Case Manager's Committee, and the Continuum of Care for the Homeless all of which the City serves as an active participant of.

## Monitoring

1. Describe how and the frequency with which you monitored your activities.

Rehabilitation is monitored as needed when in progress and subsequent programs are monitored via desk audits, whereas, the sub-recipient program is monitored quarterly for compliance and/or as the City deems it to be necessary.

2. Describe the results of your monitoring including any improvements.

Improved relationship between contractors and the City, decrease in change orders, project timeliness and/or turnaround.

3. Self-Evaluation
  - a. Describe the effect programs have in solving neighborhood and community problems.

The 5 Year Plan identified specific goals/programs as stated and implemented in its prior Year CDBG plans. All of the city's housing programs serve in eliminating blight, preserving neighborhood, not to mention creating a sense of community. Whereas accomplishments are

## Jurisdiction

small in numbers, they remain consistent and the City continues to research programs, grant initiatives and grassroots undertakings which may provide for increased accomplishments

### **Lead-based Paint**

1. Describe actions taken during the last year to evaluate and reduce lead-based paint hazards.

The City implements HUD's Green Standards as a measure to ensure Lead Safe Work Practices whereas abatement may be required. The City also provides each applicant with The Lead-Safe Certified Guide to Renovate Right Brochure, not to mention require that Contractors be Lead Based Paint Certified. Further, for all homes constructed Pre-1978 and that are applicable and meet the disturbance circumference rule during construction or rehab, necessary measures are taken, per HUD Guidelines. All painters must either be Lead Certified or at minimal be knowledgeable in implementing Lead Safe Housing Practices.

### **Housing Needs**

\*Please also refer to the Housing Needs Table in the Needs.xls workbook.

1. Describe Actions taken during the last year to foster and maintain affordable housing.

The City provides housing rehabilitation services for homeowners with incomes below 80% of AMI. The majority of the homes owned by elderly residents have incomes below 30% of AMI. The City in conjunction with Legal Aid of West Michigan provides homeowner mortgage foreclosure prevention counseling services for the residents of the City of Muskegon Heights.

### **Barriers to Affordable Housing**

1. Describe actions taken during the last year to eliminate barriers to affordable housing.

Whereas some barriers to affordable housing may include circumstances such as market failures which may lead to disinvestments of certain neighborhoods; affordability limits, low range of housing choices and current credit history jeopardizes individual capacity and ability to sustain homeownership. However, the City continues to foster programs to support minimizing these barriers to affordable housing and increasing homeownership opportunity. Moreover, the City continues its relationship with both the Fair Housing Center and Legal Aide of Western Michigan to further level the playing field whereas any potential barriers may be concerned.

### **Homeless Needs**

\*Please also refer to the Homeless Needs Table in the Needs.xls workbook.

The City is in direct link with various agencies, the PHA and the Continuum of Care

## Jurisdiction

Consortium which was devised to address the needs of the homeless. Programs developed to aid in this process include:

- The 10 Year Plan to End Homelessness;
- The Homeless Prevention and Rapid Rehousing Program (HPRRP);
- Neighborhood Stabilization Program;
- Points in Time (PIT) Survey/Report; and,
- The Muskegon County McKinney Veto Homeless Assistance Program.

Whereas the City considers addressing the Homeless Needs as an on-going process, it is programs as mentioned above, coupled with the City's Housing Programs that aide in minimizing unmet needs relative to homelessness.

Pioneer Resources continues to work in coordination with various community agencies including the Veteran's Center and the Lazarus Project to add permanent housing beds and units for vets and the chronically homeless.

## Specific Homeless Prevention Elements

1. Identify actions taken to prevent homelessness.

The Muskegon County Homeless Continuum of Care Network developed a Permanent Supportive Housing Plan for persons with physical and mental disabilities and substance abuse addictions. That Plan documents the need for permanent supportive housing units specific for those individuals that meet this criterion. Since the Plan was written, permanent supportive housing initiatives have been implemented creating additional units.

The need remains, but the Interagency Service Team that was established as part of the implementation of the supportive housing projects continues to ensure that agency services are made available so that individuals with disabilities have the opportunity to remain in their homes. The challenge is that there continues to be an increased demand for affordable housing to meet the needs of "special" populations with support services in order for them to live independently. These populations include person with mental illness or developmental disabilities, veterans, person with physical disabilities, victims of domestic violence, persons with AIDS (or HIV positive) or a history of substance abuse.

The funds in relation to the priorities, needs, goals and objectives according to the Five Year Plan were identified as follows:

PROGRAM	BUDGETED	PROPOSED ACCOMPLISHMENTS
Priority Repair	\$59,000.00	10
Moderate Repair	\$85,000.00	05
City-Wide Paint	\$50,000.00	25
Landlord Tenants Rights	\$5,000.00	N/A
Demolition	\$15,000.00	10

Jurisdiction

Housing/Code Enforcement	\$10,076.00	N/A
--------------------------	-------------	-----

**TOTAL:** \$224,076.00

PROGRAM	PROJECTED/5 YEAR ACCOMPLISHMENTS	ACTUAL/TO DATE ACCOMPLISHMENTS	YEARLY % OF ACCOMPLISHMENTS	5 YEAR % OF ACCOMPLISHMENTS	
Priority	10 / 50	10 / 48	100%	96%	
Moderate	05 / 25	05 / 29	100%	116%	
City-Wide Paint	25 / 50	25 / 125	100%	250%	
Landlord Tenant	N/A / 50	30 / 200	N/A	400%	
Demolition	10 / 50	10 / 46	100%	92%	
<b>PROGRAM</b>	<b>CT 11</b>	<b>CT 12</b>	<b>CT 13</b>	<b>CT 14.01</b>	<b>CT 14.02</b>
Priority Repair					
Mod Repair					
City-Wide Paint					
Landlord Tenant					
Demolition					

\*Census Tract (CT) information, forthcoming. This is to serve as the proposed Consolidated Annual Performance Evaluation Report, information is subject to change.





## Jurisdiction
